Focusing on Feedback

Implementing Student Leader Performance Reviews

Jen Endres
CLA First-Year Experience

Marissa Smith
Orientation & First-Year Programs
Session outcomes

- Reflect on the value of implementing student leader performance reviews
- Learn about two potential frameworks for student leader performance reviews
- Leave with tangible ideas for initiating a student leader feedback structure or enhancing your current feedback structure
Our context

CLA First-Year Experience

- 150 Section Leaders
- 22 Team Leaders
  - 4 TL Teams, each with Director
- Paid experience for the academic year
- Can apply to remain with the program
- Training entails one day in summer and ongoing biweekly 90-minute meetings throughout the academic year
- Training topics are tied to CLA’s 10 Core Career Competencies

Orientation & First-Year Programs

- 28 Orientation Leaders
- Primarily sophomores and juniors
- Paid experience runs from January - September
- No returners
- Roles and responsibilities with Orientation and Welcome Week
- Training entails a three-day winter retreat, weekly class during spring semester, and two-week summer intensive training
- Training grounded in Social Change Model
Value of feedback

- Accountability
- Continued growth
- Prepare student leaders for careers

Value of 360° feedback

- Opportunity for reflection
- Collaborative approach
- Discover overlapping themes

CLA

- Self
- Students
- Peer supervisor
- Staff supervisor

OFYP

- Self
- Students
- Peers
- Supervisor
Planning

- Tied to program values and goals
  - Strategy around student leaders
  - Fully assess student experience

- Not replacing real-time feedback
  - Value in reflecting on semester/year of experience
  - Can’t wait until end of semester to correct some behaviors

- Commitment to students
  - No surprise feedback
  - Developmental conversations related to future career path
Implementation

CLA First-Year Experience

- **Tools**
  - GoogleForm (Team Leader Evaluation)
  - Qualtrics (Student Evaluation)
  - GoogleDoc (Self Evaluation)

- **Timeline**
  - Week 9 - Student Evaluation
  - Early November - TL GoogleForm
  - 2 Days Prior - Self-Eval and Resume due
  - 1:1 meetings between mid-November and last day of Fall Semester

- **1:1 Meeting**
  - 30 Minutes
  - Shared copy of performance review
  - Open discussion
  - Review resume

Orientation & First-Year Programs

- **Tools**
  - GoogleDoc (supervisor notes)
  - Qualtrics (Student & peer evaluation)

- **Timeline**
  - Feedback form open for three weeks in July - August
  - Supervisor feedback due before Welcome Week begins
  - 1:1 meetings on a rolling basis between August - September

- **1:1 Meeting**
  - 1 hour
  - Shared copy of performance review
  - Open discussion
CLA Process
2 Directors of Team Development

↓

12 Team Leaders

↓

150 Section Leaders
2 Directors of Team Development

12 Team Leaders

150 Section Leaders
Framework - FY Student Evaluation

● What is your Section Leader’s name?
  ○ Open ended question

● How would you rate the quality of your Section Leader’s communication this semester?
  ○ Very High / High / Average / Low / Very Low

● How supportive has your Section Leader been in your transition to the UofMN?
  ○ Very Supportive / Supportive / Not Supportive

● How has your Section Leader supported you this semester?
  ○ Open ended question
Her responses to my assignments are specific, kind, and helpful.

Gave me confidence in being able to choose a career

She has made it very clear that she is there to help

She seemed very caring about my thoughts about the semester

Made me feel confident about my decision to come here

She has been a positive force and encourages my work

We bonded over the mental health assignment

She is very caring and it shows through her part in this course
Framework - Team Leader Evaluation

● Check-in for Team Leader
  ○ How has the semester been going for YOU, are YOU always on time and engaged to biweekly meetings

● Check-in on team as a whole
  ○ How engaged is your TEAM during biweekly meetings

● Check-in on individual Section Leaders
  ○ Write at least a couple of sentences about each Section Leader on your team
  ○ What improvements can each of your Section Leaders make

● Team Leader plan of action
  ○ How can you support Section Leaders who are doing well
  ○ How can you support Section Leaders who need to make improvements
Framework - Self Evaluation

- What was your most meaningful accomplishment of Fall 2016? The highlight?
- What was/is your most challenging responsibility?
- Were there changes in our work or how we do our work that you found positive? Challenging?
- **What opportunities do you hope for in the next semester? Are there specific projects or initiatives you hope to work on (new or current)?**
- **What ongoing training do you look for in the upcoming semester?**
- Comment on the level of autonomy you feel in your work. Is it appropriate for you?
- Comment on how you might be better supervised.
- What are your long-term career goals?
- How do you see your duties in this role fitting in with your career objectives?
- **What other skill(s) would you like to be gaining in this role as it relates to your career objectives?**
Framework - Self Evaluation

- Welcome Week - College Day
- One-on-One Meetings
- Biweekly Meetings
- Emails, Grading & Feedback
- Other Duties

- Scheduling 1:1s
- Facilitating a conversation with open-ended questions
- Relationship-building with students
- Knowledge of campus resources to answer student questions
- Major/minor and career discussions and referrals
- Discussing transferring colleges
- Working with students in stressful circumstances
Framework - Self Evaluation

- Welcome Week - College Day
- One-on-One Meetings
- Biweekly Meetings
- Emails, Grading & Feedback
- Other Duties

- Providing timely (within 24 hours) responses to student emails
- Sending weekly email to entire section with relevant content
- Providing personalized feedback to each week’s assignment
- Timely (by Sunday evening) entering of grades into Moodle
## Framework - Self Evaluation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Satisfaction</th>
<th>Expertise</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>5 = This is one of my favorite parts</td>
<td>5 = I believe I am an expert on this activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>of the job</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 = I thoroughly enjoy this task</td>
<td>4 = I am very skilled at this task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 = I get some satisfaction from this</td>
<td>3 = I know enough about this task to do it well</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>task</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 = I get very little enjoyment from</td>
<td>2 = I need help with some of the finer details of</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>completing this task</td>
<td>this task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1 = I think about looking for a new</td>
<td>1 = I prefer to seek assistance to complete this</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>job every time I do this task</td>
<td>task</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Framework - Self Evaluation

1. Two things I am GREAT at in this role.

2. Two ways I plan to IMPROVE or STRETCH MYSELF next semester.
Framework - Review Document

- Summarize Student Feedback
  - Number of students
  - Totals for each rating
  - Select quotes
- Quotes from Team Leader Feedback
- Self-Evaluation
  - Ratings with 1 or 2
- Initial Goal(s) for the Position
  - From when they were hired in Sp16
- Goal(s) for Spring 2017
- Additional Notes
1. Analytical & Critical Thinking
2. Applied Problem Solving
3. Ethical Reasoning & Decision Making
4. Innovation & Creativity
5. Oral & Written Communication
6. Teamwork & Leadership
7. Engaging Diversity
8. Active Citizenship & Community Engagement
9. Digital Literacy
10. Career Management
OFYP Process
## Framework - OFYP

- Unit’s core values
- University’s student development outcomes
- Productive & unproductive behaviors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Comment Type</th>
<th>Content</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>OL Comments:</strong></td>
<td>Inserted OL comments as is.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Peer Comments:</strong></td>
<td><em>Edited content, provided direct quotes, highlighted patterns, avoided anything too personal, unproductive.</em></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Supervisor Comments</strong></td>
<td><em>Provided summary statements, added any missing information, inserted additional student comments here.</em></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Core Values

- Student success
- Building community
- Collaboration
- Leadership
- Commitment to Excellence
Student Development Outcomes

- Responsibility & accountability
- Independence & interdependence
- Self-awareness
- Appreciation of differences
- Resilience
- Tolerance of ambiguity
- Goal orientation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OFYP Core Values</th>
<th>Productive Behaviors</th>
<th>Unproductive behaviors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Student success</strong>&lt;br&gt;&lt;em&gt;Dedicated to the success of each individual&lt;/em&gt;</td>
<td>- Passionately works to help students understand and thrive in their transition&lt;br&gt;- Understands how to create a welcoming environment for new students and their guests&lt;br&gt;- Makes appropriate decisions regarding behavior and energy level</td>
<td>- Fails to meet quality of work standards (for example, sharing inaccuracies, errors, student dissatisfaction)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OFYP Core Values</td>
<td>Productive Behaviors</td>
<td>Unproductive behaviors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Building community</strong></td>
<td>- Interacts effectively with others despite differences</td>
<td>- Exhibits a reluctance to learn about the importance of diversity and convey this value to others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Celebrating diversity, encouraging responsibility, and creating a sense of belonging</em></td>
<td>- Actions reflect intercultural development and adaptability</td>
<td>- Demonstrates a lack of respect for a values and beliefs of others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDOs emphasized:</td>
<td>- Increases individual and group understanding of culture and cultural competency</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Appreciation of differences</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OFYP Core Values</td>
<td>Productive Behaviors</td>
<td>Unproductive behaviors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **Collaboration**  
*Strengthening our work by building relationships* | - Accurately determines when to act alone and when to consult with others  
- Promotes an atmosphere of mutual respect and cooperation  
- Puts the group’s success ahead of personal goals  
- Shares information and resources with others  
- Deals with conflict effectively  
- Identifies problems beyond and within their own team and works to improve the situation  
- Shares ideas, encourages, and helps others when needed  
- Supports open communication | - Lacks flexibility in response to issues or problems  
- Has inappropriate interpersonal relations  
- Has an inappropriate or closed communication style  
- Displays impatience or inconsiderateness  
- Has a destructive sense of humor, sarcasm, horseplay, fighting  
- Has inappropriate conflict with others  
- Resists change  
- Shows an unwillingness to listen |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OFYP Core Values</th>
<th>Productive Behaviors</th>
<th>Unproductive behaviors</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Leadership</strong></td>
<td>- Maintains and projects an optimistic perspective&lt;br&gt;- Expects the best from self and others&lt;br&gt;- Accurately assesses and articulates (when appropriate) personal strengths and weaknesses&lt;br&gt;- Shows interest in learning about others and their accomplishments&lt;br&gt;- Demonstrates ability to help</td>
<td>- Regularly projects a negative or defensive perspective&lt;br&gt;- Demonstrates an overly-controlling, grandiose, or passive aggressive approach&lt;br&gt;- Makes excuses or blames others for mistakes or shortcomings&lt;br&gt;- Unwilling to help self or others</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Developing the leader within each of us</em></td>
<td><strong>SDOs emphasized:</strong>&lt;br&gt;- Self-awareness</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OFYP Core Values</td>
<td>Productive Behaviors</td>
<td>Unproductive behaviors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Commitment to Excellence
  Pursuing our work with professionalism, innovation, scholarship, and integrity | - Pushes self and others, when needed, to accomplish
  - Offers creative solutions to issues
  - Able to recover from and work through disappointments or bad experiences
  - Works effectively under conditions of uncertainty | - Demonstrates poor prioritizing, timing, scheduling
  - Contributes to lost time by showing a slow response to work-related requests or responsibilities
  - Continually causing preventable accidents
  - Showing inappropriate physical behavior, like smoking, eating, drinking, sleeping on the job, poor personal hygiene
  - Behaving in a threatening, hostile, or intimidating way |

SDOs emphasized:
- Resilience
- Tolerance of ambiguity
Lessons learned

- Internal benefits, surfaced areas for improvements to the program
- Expand to other leader positions
- Share rationale and criteria early
- Focus on recognition
- Resources to provide quality feedback
What questions do you have?